

N A T O C O N F I D E N T I A L

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH/FRENCH
21st October, 1971

POLADS(71)66(Revised)

add. 21-10-71

To: Political Committee

From: Acting Chairman

EAST-WEST CO-OPERATION TO IMPROVE
THE HUMAN ENVIRONMENT

Attached is a revised draft by the International Staff which aims at taking into account the amendments proposed at the Committee's meeting on Tuesday morning. It is hoped that at our meeting on Friday morning we will be able to agree that this text, amended as necessary, may be submitted to the Senior Political Committee as the final contribution on environment for the latter Committee's report on Possible East-West Negotiations.

(Signed) G.R.A. ANDREWS

NATO,
1110 Brussels.

N A T O C O N F I D E N T I A L

EAST-WEST CO-OPERATION TO IMPROVE THE HUMAN

ENVIRONMENT

I. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROBLEM

Introduction

1. The problem of the human environment occupies a rather special place among the range of issues that could possibly be tackled under an expansion of the East-West co-operation. By their very nature, environmental questions call for solutions which transcend national frontiers. Furthermore, as these nuisances directly affect the everyday lives of people in the East and West, the political implications are less pronounced than in the other possible fields for negotiation. Most important of all the East European countries have, on several occasions, expressed interest in taking concerted action with the West to protect the environment. The Soviet leaders did so at the 24th Party Congress and again in subsequent statements. The recent ECE Symposium in Prague also provided an opportunity for the Eastern countries to demonstrate their interest and express their views on this problem.

2. It may therefore be assumed that common ground will be more easily found early on in discussions with the East in this field than in the case of more politically sensitive issues. It will probably be easier to identify the concrete benefits likely to stem from East-West co-operation.

The special nature of environmental questions is also the reason for the fact that the considerations outlined below do not follow exactly the same pattern as **that** adopted in the other sections of the report.

Allied point of view

3. In any discussions with the East, the active rôle played by the CCMS in the study and careful preparation of a large number of environmental questions should be described. There is much to be gained from emphasising in this way the painstaking preparatory work which has been carried out over the last few months, not only within the Alliance, but also by the national authorities.

4. Within the general context of East-West negotiations, environmental questions provide the Allied countries with an opportunity of furnishing additional proof of their goodwill and their desire for fruitful co-operation, from which in actual fact the Eastern countries will derive most benefit. The negotiating position of the Alliance is bound to capture the imagination of the public, which is fully conscious of the need to protect the environment.

5. In framing Western proposals, it will also be necessary to take account of the Eastern viewpoints which are summarised below.

Point of view of the Eastern countries

6. General considerations

(a) The fields of the environment on which the East places the greatest emphasis are the problem of pollution and the preservation of natural resources.

- (b) In contrast to Western proposals, Eastern European statements on this matter appear to be vague and undefined. One reason for this could be that research and action programmes in the East are less advanced than they have been in recent years in the West.
- (c) It is clear that the East would favour a regional approach rather than the so-called global approach. For example, Mr. Kosygin confined his proposals to the European region.
- (d) It is also noteworthy that Soviet leaders do not draw a clear distinction between environmental co-operation and purely economic projects, such as the development of power, transport and communications(1).
- (e) The high cost of corrective measures against pollution seems to be of major concern to the East. Presumably for this reason, the ECE Prague Communiqué favours a preventive rather than a remedial policy.
- (f) Another matter of concern to the East seems to be the impact of environmental policies on foreign trade. The Prague Communiqué stressed specifically that environmental measures should not interfere with international trade.
- (g) Further information concerning the views of Eastern European countries is contained at Annex: Eastern European Interest in Environmental Questions.

(1) Kosygin's remarks at the 24th CPSU Congress are also illustrative of this point. He stressed that the holding of a CES "could create conditions for solving such problems as the organization of transcontinental carriages, the building of large power transmission lines and establishment on this basis of a single European power grid, leading up to cardinal advances towards solving the problem of the fuel-and-power balance".

Prague Symposium Proposals

7. At the Prague Symposium on environmental problems, the participating nations put forward several proposals concerning the possible forms of international co-operation:

- (a) Co-operation could be realized on a bilateral basis directly between Eastern and Western countries through:
- exchange of information;
 - consultations (if conflicts of interests arose between nations);
 - agreements between neighbouring countries (when an environmental problem goes beyond national borders; in this case, practical measures would be particularly desirable; in fact, they would be indispensable);
 - development of a system of generally accepted principles in the social and economic fields.
- (b) Co-operation could also be pursued on a multilateral basis within the framework of the ECE:
- the senior environmental advisers of governments of ECE countries might undertake sector studies on ways and means of diminishing pollution and begin some inter-disciplinary studies in that field;
 - the ECE might study the possibilities of creating an information centre on the environment;

- attention was drawn to the need to create teams for inter-disciplinary research on environmental problems and to provide for close co-operation among the scientists of various countries.

II. POSSIBLE FORMULAS FOR CONCRETE EAST-WEST CO-OPERATION

8. The following suggestions will not be submitted to the East before the start of the preparatory phase of the conference. Some of them are already being acted on, but this will not prevent their inclusion in the Western proposals, which could make it clear that the Allies want to bring forward new ideas and at the same time put existing practices on a systematic footing.

9. Until more sustained contacts have been established between East and West in order to provide a basis for co-operation on the environment, it is probably difficult to determine the framework, within which such co-operation can evolve. The following ideas are presented merely as examples. Only during the preparatory phase of the conference, will it be possible to ascertain if an overall agreement is feasible on one or other of the suggestions. Nevertheless it should be noted that the Eastern European countries have also contemplated working within the ECE. Finally, the Alliance countries, applying their experience gained in CCMS projects, will clearly have a considerable influence on the activities planned within the framework of East-West co-operation.

Possible rôle of the Economic Commission for Europe (ECE)

10. The Economic Commission for Europe is an existing, UN-affiliated organization with long experience in this field. As noted above, it has established a new subsidiary body, the

DECLASSIFIED/DECLASSIFIÉE - PUBLIC DISCLOSED/MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

Committee of Senior Environmental Advisors of ECE governments. The Allies suggested in their last report (paragraph 111, C-M(71)40(Revised)), that at a CES it might be agreed to call upon the ECE to deal with specific questions related to environmental co-operation. Under such an arrangement, participants in the CES could, in the ECE, request study of certain specific topics connected with the human environment, in accordance with procedures to be worked out. Such suggestions arising from a CES could well strengthen the work of the ECE and improve its capabilities to deal meaningfully with some environmental problems.

Pilot nation initiatives

11. The pilot nation concept as developed by CCMS offers potential flexibility in organizing international co-operation on environmental subjects. Pilot projects, although CCMS approved, are primarily national rather than NATO undertakings. Following approved consultative procedures, non-NATO countries (including those of Eastern Europe) have been invited to participate in pilot country activities. Some non-NATO countries have accepted and participated, although none as yet from Warsaw Pact countries. The potential always exists, depending upon the nature of the subject matter, the willingness of the countries involved and the necessary co-ordination within the Alliance, to expand co-operation with Warsaw Pact countries through pilot country projects.

Action by the CCMS

12. Reference has already been made (in paragraph 3) to the active rôle of the CCMS in the study and careful preparation of a large number of environmental questions. Technically, the following alternatives are possible after the European Security Conference, provided a genuine interest and a willingness to attend have been demonstrated by the Eastern Europeans which might open up perspectives for concrete co-operation:

- (a) The CCMS could invite observers from Eastern Europe to its meetings, together with observers from other appropriate countries and organizations. CCMS meetings are unclassified and take place in a non-secure area.
- (b) CCMS representatives could be authorized to take part in environmental activities held by neutral countries, international organizations and even by Eastern European countries (although this possibility will require further study in the Alliance).

Fora

13. CES could play an important rôle in adding high-level political support to East-West environmental co-operation. A CES itself would not, however, become actively involved in the actual carrying out of specific projects in this field, but would look to competent international organizations.

14. Depending upon the nature of the environmental co-operative activity which CES participants decide to pursue, a number of forums could be used, including:

- ECE;
- IMCO;
- WHO;
- other UN specialized agencies;
- ad hoc multilateral arrangements, as appropriate;
- any machinery resulting from the Stockholm Conference on the Environment.

15. Pilot studies may be developed, following the format of CCMS, and may be associated as appropriate with CCMS if the countries concerned so desire.

16. In seeking appropriate channels for environmental co-operation, a CES should be guided by the proven effectiveness of an organization or method in identifying timely solutions to concrete problems in an advanced technological era."

* * *

17. With respect to the ideas contained in paragraphs 10, 11 and 16 above, one delegation was of the opinion that it was inappropriate to envisage any rôle at all for the CCMS, either directly or indirectly through the pilot nation concept, because of the danger of a bloc to bloc approach resulting in the politicization of the environmental question.

* * *

III. SUBSTANCE OF A POSSIBLE WESTERN PROPOSAL

18. General principles

As an introduction to the Western proposals, it will be necessary to define the basic principles underlying the desired East-West co-operation. Most of the points to be included in such a definition have already been listed in C-M(71)40(Revised).

19. Choice of issues

It would seem logical to start by giving prominence to issues in which the Eastern countries have already shown interest. Other topics for co-operation which the Allied countries have an interest in tabling could be added later to the initial list. The following listing of subjects should not, however, be considered as limitative. On the other hand, in considering subjects of negotiation with the East in the environmental field, a pragmatic approach should be adopted to take account of specific problems relating to East-West co-operation: these subjects could be taken up in the framework of the CCMS, or not, depending on the desires of the East Europeans.

Areas of co-operation proposed by the East

20. Ocean pollution

(a) Comments by the Eastern countries

Kosygin has expressed interest in this question. Furthermore, in the recently published programme for intra-CEMA co-operation, one of the aims is to guarantee that the quality and quantity of COMECON water resources - with special reference to the Tisa and Danube basins - are adequate.

(b) Western proposals

The pilot country - Belgium - might consider whether and if so, how one or several Eastern countries could participate directly in any of the three present projects:

- establishment of a mathematical model of the North Sea;
- evaluation of technologies for reducing pollution;
- implementation of oil spills elimination policy.

Turkey might consider re-opening the question of the technical participation of Western experts in a Black Sea programme, which is being undertaken by the USSR, Bulgaria and Rumania. Member countries of the Alliance, in particular those of the Mediterranean region, might have an interest in such participation.

The dumping of toxic and solid wastes in recognized and potential fishing grounds, in shallow areas or in the high seas could also be included.

(c) Advantages for the West

Such proposals would offer the advantage of building on the already considerable success the CCMS has enjoyed in this field.

Public Health

21. [To be circulated separately]

22. Air pollution

(a) Comments by the Eastern countries

The East European countries hold the view that air pollution problems would benefit from co-operation with present international efforts. According to press reports, the Soviets are pursuing studies in air pollution measurement and control; these seem to be similar to those currently underway under CCMS auspices in various member countries.

(b) Western proposals

The suggestions set out in paragraph 58 of C-M(71)40(Revised) could be put forward. It might be added that the European air pollution survey carried out by the OECD could usefully be expanded to include Eastern countries.

A new CCMS project under preparation use of modern technology day-to-day health care. The objective of the organisation is to spread public health

Other areas of co-operation of interest to the West

23. Inland water pollution

(a) Advantages for the West

One of the aims of the CCMS study directed by Canada is to draw attention to ways in which countries can co-operate in reducing inland water pollution to their mutual benefit. It will develop improved techniques and concepts for fresh water quality management - with special reference to spheres of legal competence.

A number of the large rivers in Europe flow through several countries. Moreover, the dispersion of the effluents has an immediate bearing on the problem of coastal water pollution. This is therefore likely to become a most fruitful field for East-West co-operation. High Soviet officials, in

Delivery Systems is concerned with the to improve the steadily increasing ng demands for medical essentially to improve gical basis for wide- th Western scientists, have shown interest in problems such as the pollution limit in inland vegetable and animal life is destroyed, or the jor waterways. Such clearly defined problems, amongst others, might be:

- (i) desulphurization of fumes;
- (ii) replacement of phosphates in detergents;
- (iii) disposal of waste material containing PVC;
- (iv) solution of the problem of eutrophication of inland waters.

DECLASSIFIED/DECLASSIFIEE - PUBLIC DISCLOSED/MISE EN LECTURE PUBLIQUE

(b) Western proposals

Canada, the pilot country, may want to invite Eastern experts to participate in aspects of the study where exchanges of information and know-how may prove mutually beneficial.

Contacts could be established between scientists and experts in inter-state bodies which administer or supervise the utilization of international rivers, such as the Rhine, the Danube or the Elbe.

A link might be created with the pilot study on Environment and Regional Planning. Here, useful exchanges could take place about French experience regarding the setting up of the "Agences de Bassin" and the management of river basins.

24. Highway safety

(a) Advantages for East and West

The Soviet Union and the Eastern Allies are on the verge of developing large-scale car production. Consequently, the volume of traffic, which is still light, is likely to become greater. Any preventive measures that can be taken to reduce the level of casualties to be expected as a result of the increased traffic should be welcomed by the East. Moreover, should new safety laws be adopted in the future, they will undoubtedly have an impact on the development of international trade and, therefore, should also attract interest from the East. Road safety is one of the areas in which CCMS work has progressed fast, and considerable information of great interest has **already** emerged. Various international agreements have also been concluded, especially as regards the development of an experimental safety vehicle.

(b) Western proposals

Consideration could be given to the following suggestions contained in paragraph 61 of C-M(71)40(Revised): drunken driving and road safety, accident investigation, experimental safety vehicles, pedestrian safety and emergency medical services.

IV. OTHER POSSIBLE FIELDS FOR EAST-WEST CO-OPERATION

25. Disaster assistance programme

(a) Advantages for East and West

Large-scale natural disasters are increasingly disruptive and costly because of urbanization and economic specialization. Generally, they cannot be avoided, but prevention programmes can be designed to mitigate their effects. Natural disasters do not normally affect several countries at one time, and therefore remain essentially national in character. International scientific co-operation is indispensable for the research and identification of preventive techniques, and is highly desirable for the development of these techniques and the assistance to be provided after a disaster has occurred. Eastern countries are also facing increasingly rapid urbanization and economic specialization; this entails correspondingly greater risks from natural disasters and makes it all the more necessary to prevent them or mitigate their effects.

(b) Western proposals

A first step was the invitation recently extended by the United States, pilot country, to several Eastern governments to participate in an earthquake meeting held in San Francisco under the aegis of the CCMS. Although, generally speaking,

the preventive or mitigating aspects of environmental challenges should be considered first, the question of how to deal with natural disasters may be an exception, and the rehabilitation of the people's living conditions, housing, public facilities or land reconstitution would probably take precedence.

26. Urban problems

(a) Advantages for East and West

Urban problems do not seem to be of major concern in Eastern countries where adequate housing is still scarcer than in the West. However, the East may be willing to take stock of Western investigations into ways and means of improving and renovating the urban environment and of counter-
ing pollution by preventive rather than remedial methods.

(b) Western proposals

It should be recalled that the French project on Environment and Regional Planning specifically aims at developing techniques to prevent pollution as from the inception of a new town. The future results from the pilot projects emerging from the Indianapolis Conference should be borne in mind in helping determine courses of action.

ANNEX

As stated in paragraph 6(g) the American paper of 13th September on views of Eastern European countries on environment questions will be attached as an Annex to the final report.